

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL BY THE CITY INTERNAL AUDITOR

AUDIT OF THE POLICE DEPARTMENT, ADMINISTRATION DIVISION, TECHNICAL SERVICES BUREAU

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT 060108-11

June 30, 2008



June 30, 2008

Councilman Joe Shyne
Chairman, Shreveport City Council

Dear Councilman Shyne:

Subject: IAR 060108-11 - Audit of the Police Department, Administration Division,
Technical Services Bureau

Attached please find the report mentioned above. Management comments are included in the report.

Sincerely,

Leanis L. Graham, CPA, CIA
City Internal Auditor

lp

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

AUDIT OF THE

POLICE DEPARTMENT, ADMINISTRATION DIVISION

TECHNICAL SERVICES BUREAU

INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT (IAR) 060108-11

The purpose of the executive summary is to convey in capsule form the significant issues of the audit report. The executive summary is a vehicle for reviewing the report and should only be used in conjunction with the entire report.

INTRODUCTION

The Technical Services Bureau is responsible for managing the police fleet, staffing all special events in the City with police personnel, administering all police grants, and reviewing and revising all policies and procedures.

The Technical Services Bureau employs 15 employees, including a Captain position, the top administrative position.

RECOMMENDATION EVALUATION RISK CRITERIA

The chart below summarizes the recommendations outlined in the report and our evaluation of risk for the recommendations. We evaluated the importance of each audit recommendation by assigning each a level of risk. The risk levels, as defined in the chart below, were determined based on the possible results for the entity if the recommendations are not implemented.

<i>Risk Levels</i>	<i>Recommendations</i>
High Risk Possibility of fraud, waste, and abuse of City assets; Interrupted and/or disrupted operations; Entity's mission not being met; Adverse publicity.	None Applicable
Medium Risk Possibility of continuing, significant operating inefficiencies and high-level non-compliance issues.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Establish bureau orders and distribute (Finding 1). ▪ Improve Security over electronic General Orders (Finding 2). ▪ Establish a documented vehicle and equipment replacement policy (Finding 3). ▪ Maintain a centralized computerized record of training statistics (Finding 4). ▪ Consider remodeling or relocating the Special Events Unit and Fleet Services Unit (Finding 5). ▪ Require officers to provide signed subpoena or attendance slip or assign an officer to City Court to monitor attendance. (Finding 6). ▪ Implement an automated work order system (Finding 7). ▪ Consider using additional performance measures (Finding 8). ▪ Perform assessment of staffing needs (Finding 9). ▪ Ensure that the database is consistently updated and complete (Finding 10).
Low Risk Possibility of continuing operating inefficiencies and some low-level non-compliance issues.	None Applicable

INDEX

Executive Summary	1
Index	2
Objectives	3
Scope and Methodology	3
Background.....	3
Conclusions/Findings/Recommendations.....	4

FINDINGS

	<u>Risk</u>	
	<u>Factor</u>	
1. Policies and Procedures.....	Medium.....	4
2. Information Security and Integrity.....	Medium.....	5
3. Vehicle/Equipment Replacement Policy	Medium.....	6
4. Training and Development	Medium.....	6
5. Work Space.....	Medium.....	7
6. Verification of Court Attendance.....	Medium.....	8
7. Work Order System.....	Medium.....	9
8. Performance Indicators	Medium.....	10
9. Staffing Needs/Assessments	Medium.....	11
10. Vehicle/Equipment Database	Medium.....	12

**AUDIT OF THE
POLICE DEPARTMENT, ADMINISTRATION DIVISION
TECHNICAL SERVICES BUREAU
INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT (IAR) 060108-11**

OBJECTIVES

We have completed an audit of the Police Department, Administration Division – Technical Services Bureau. The objective of this audit was to determine the economy and efficiency of operations of the Technical Services Bureau.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

Our audit was performed in accordance with applicable generally accepted governmental auditing standards defined in Section A.20 of the Internal Audit Office Operating Instructions Manual. The scope of the study of internal control was limited to the general controls surrounding the specific issues addressed. General audit procedures included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Reviewing applicable records and documents.
- Interviewing appropriate operating personnel and management.
- Observing operations.

BACKGROUND

The Technical Services Bureau is responsible for managing the police fleet, staffing all special events in the City with police personnel, administering all police grants, and reviewing and revising all policies and procedures. The Technical Services Bureau employs 15 employees, including a Captain position, the top administrative position.

The Bureau consists of five units: Grants, Special Events, Court Liaison, Planning and Research, and Fleet Services.

Grants is responsible for administering all grants including the preparation of budgets and financial reports for each grant.

Special Events is responsible for administering, monitoring, coordinating, and assigning extra-duty employment (e.g., parades, festivals, movie productions, wedding receptions etc.), scheduling and overseeing funeral escorts, and all other escort services.

Court Liaison is responsible for sorting and distributing City, District, and Juvenile Court subpoenas throughout the Police Department and ensuring that officers are attending court.

Planning and Research is responsible for drafting, reviewing, and revising policies, procedures and guidelines associated with the administration of departmental operations and improving departmental efficiency.

Fleet Services is responsible for coordinating the installation, maintenance, repair, and replacement of equipment (e.g., walkie talkies, laptops, video camera system, emergency light and siren equipment, etc.) in the Police vehicles. Fleet Services is responsible for maintaining the vehicle and equipment database and coordinating with Risk Management and insurance agencies regarding vehicle accidents, incidents, shootings, and general liability issues.

CONCLUSIONS/FINDINGS/RECOMMENDATIONS

The Internal Audit Office would like to offer its appreciation for the courtesy, patience, and cooperation extended to us during the audit by the staff of the Technical Services Bureau.

Based on our review, we believe management could enhance the efficiency and control environment by addressing the following concerns:

- Establish bureau orders and distribute a copy to all members assigned to the bureau.
- Improve security over electronic General Orders distributed to employees.
- Establish a formal documented replacement policy for vehicles and equipment.
- Maintain a centralized computerized record of training statistics for employees.
- Consider remodeling or relocating the Special Events Unit and Fleet Services Unit.
- Require officers to provide a signed subpoena or attendance slip by court officials or assign an officer to City Court to monitor attendance.
- Implement an automated work order system that allows for prioritization and justification of work.
- Consider using additional performance measures and developing a system that would allow for the reporting of the accomplishments of the measures.
- Perform assessment of staffing needs.
- Ensure that the vehicle/equipment database is consistently updated and complete.

1. Policies and Procedures

Criteria: Shreveport Police Department (SPD) General Order 201.04 states: *“Each bureau within the department shall use bureau orders to establish operational procedures within the respective bureau. Bureau orders shall be established by bureau commanders and the order(s) shall parallel departmental and divisional general orders. These orders shall detail bureau responsibilities, duty tasks, and specific bureau procedures. Bureau orders shall be designed to define “how to” accomplish bureau responsibilities. Bureau orders shall apply only to those members assigned to the respective bureau. Collectively, these bureau orders shall establish the bureau procedural manual. The bureau procedural manual shall be an*

IAR 060108-11

annex to the appropriate divisional manual in which the bureau is organizationally assigned. Each member assigned to the respective bureau shall receive a copy of the bureau procedural manual annex along with the divisional manual."

<Auditor's Note> The Police Department does have a comprehensive manual ("Shreveport Police Department General Orders") that addresses departmental wide issues.

Condition: The Technical Services Bureau had not established any bureau orders.

Effect:

- Possibility of operational interruptions.
- Possible inadequate sense of direction for employees.
- Possible inability to readily assess accuracy and consistency of daily operations.
- Operations may be ineffective or inefficient.
- Security of files may be compromised (i.e., electronic policies).

Cause: Management had not realized the benefit of establishing the bureau orders.

Recommendation: We recommend the Technical Services Bureau establish bureau orders and distribute a copy to all members assigned to the bureau.

Management Plan of Action: To establish and implement bureau orders for the Technical Services Bureau in accordance with audit recommendations.

Timetable: Completion is expected by December 31, 2008.

2. Information Security and Integrity

Criteria: Adequate security over electronic information should be provided to protect data from unauthorized changes.

Condition: The Police Department, Technical Services Bureau, provides the General Orders in an electronic as well as manual format to its employees. The policies and procedures distributed in the electronic format are not adequately protected. They are in Microsoft Word which means changes could be made to the manual by unauthorized personnel intentionally or accidentally.

Effect:

- Unauthorized updates or changes could occur.
- Possibility of incomplete and inaccurate information.

Cause: Management had not addressed the security issues for the electronic information.

Recommendation: Management should obtain software that adequately protects policies and procedures information from unauthorized users. For example,

management should determine if the Information Technology Department could install the free software "Cute PDF" or some other software that converts the Word files to another format (e.g., PDF format) to allow for a more secure and dependable electronic policies and procedures manual.

Management Plan of Action: Management feels that steps already in place are sufficient, and that additional security measures are not warranted. The policy and procedures files available on LAN are in Microsoft Word as read only files. Although the files can be copied and saved, the master copy which is kept in the Planning and Research Unit is not affected. In addition, the files made available electronically are for reference only, and only paper copies signed by the Chief of Police are considered official documents. Therefore any attempt to manipulate any official copy of the rules and regulations can not be accomplished by accessing the files available on LAN.

Timetable: N/A

3. Vehicle/Equipment Replacement Policy

Criteria: A replacement policy is a tool used by management to evaluate the need for replacing apparatus that has surpassed its useful life and aids management in more accurate forecasting of budgetary needs. Also, a replacement policy helps ensure that a reliable, safe, and effective fleet is maintained to provide the necessary services required of the citizens.

Condition: During the course of the audit, we noted that the Police Department Fleet Services Unit had not established a formal documented vehicle and equipment replacement policy.

Effect:

- Potential for excessive repairs and work orders.
- Potential for excessive downtime.
- Potential for short-term budgetary shortages.
- Potential for major component failure.

Cause: Management had not established a formal documented vehicle and equipment replacement policy.

Recommendation: We recommend that management establish a formal documented replacement policy for vehicles and equipment to include: criteria for replacing vehicles and equipment (e.g., mileage, age, cost of repairs), exceptions to the general criteria, and safeguards to ensure the disposition of vehicles and equipment replaced.

Management Plan of Action: To establish a formal vehicle and equipment replacement policy in accordance with audit recommendations, to include exceptions for budgetary constraints.

Timetable: Completion is expected by December 31, 2008.

4. Training and Development

Criteria: Employees should receive training and development to ensure that the objectives of economy, efficiency, and effectiveness for an organization are attained.

Condition: Management does not maintain a centralized computerized record of training statistics for its employees. As a result, it is difficult to adequately analyze, assess, and evaluate training needs for each individual, group, or functional area. The training records for Police Department employees are maintained in the personnel files for each employee in the Human Resources Bureau.

As a result of our inquiries of Technical Services Bureau staff we determined there was a need or desire for training.

Effect:

- Possibility of inadequately and improperly trained employees.
- Possible inefficiencies in job performance.
- Possible inadequate identification of training needs.
- Possible low employee morale.

Cause: Management had not realized the benefit in having a centralized computerized training file.

Recommendation: We recommend that management:

- a. Maintain a centralized computerized record of training statistics for employees.
- b. Develop a written policy on training and development to be included as part of the policies and procedures manual to ensure necessary training is acquired. This training may consist of the necessary skills to stay abreast of laws and regulations for grants, manage fleet and deal with ever changing technology.

Management Plan of Action: To centralize employee training records within the department and to establish a written procedure for the use, maintenance and scope of the records. Due to currently fragmented training records, it is likely that centralized records will begin anew without historical information.

Timetable: A new procedure and written policy is expected by December 31, 2008.

5. Work Space

Criteria: To ensure operational effectiveness and efficiency, an adequate working environment is necessary.

Condition: An observation of Technical Services Bureau office layout revealed a

IAR 060108-11

cramped office space for the Special Events Unit in which three individuals share the office. The cramped office space did not lend itself to creating the most effective and efficient working environment possible. There was a lack of space to meet with vendors or event promoters and spread out maps to plan events.

Also, we noted that the Fleet Services Unit is located in the basement which causes it to be isolated from the rest of the Technical Services Bureau located on the first floor. Therefore, this makes supervision difficult. Furthermore, there is no designated secure garage for the staff to repair, install, or test the equipment in the police units. They are currently using the police department parking garage where inmates are being transported in and out of the Police Department.

Effect:

- Possibility of low employee morale.
- Possibility of inefficient operations.

Cause: Inadequate space planning has resulted in this concern.

Recommendation: Consideration should be given to remodeling or relocating the Special Events Unit and Fleet Services Unit.

Management Plan of Action: Fleet Services is located in the basement of the police department by design. Management believes this provides better access to the actual fleet and to the garage where maintenance and repairs are made. In addition, the parking lot adjacent to the fleet office space is covered, allowing for much of their work to continue even in inclement weather. Management feels that Fleet Services current location is ideal. Special Events: Although the Special Events Unit does operate in a relatively small work area, the amount of space available to each employee housed there is consistent with many other areas of the City and Police Department. Special Events work is unique and operates more effectively when the employees work in close proximity to each other satisfying the need to communicate verbally from desk to desk. In addition, the unit has access to at least three different rooms on the same floor equipped with conference tables for holding meetings and to conduct planning. Management believes that the location of both units is adequate, and that no significant changes are needed at this time.

Timetable: N/A

6. Verification of Court Attendance

Criteria: Shreveport Police Department General Order (SPD) 301.05 states: *"It shall be the policy of the Shreveport Police Department to ensure members appear as required by subpoena and that the issuing authority is adequately notified in those situations in which the member's appearance is impossible."*

The Court Liaison is responsible for distributing City, District, and Juvenile Court subpoenas throughout the Police Department. The subpoenaed officers are

IAR 060108-11

required to appear in court unless they receive an approved excused absence. When an officer is not excused from a proceeding and does not have an approved excused absence, disciplinary action is taken.

Verification of officers' attendance at court (legal proceedings) is necessary to take disciplinary action against officers who have unexcused absences from legal proceedings and to ensure any court overtime acquired is appropriate.

Condition: There have been problems with City Court not notifying the Court Liaison when an officer fails to appear in court. The City Prosecutors have been asked to notify the Court Liaison in writing (e.g., email, initials on court dockets, etc.) but there have been instances when this has not occurred.

Effect:

- Inability to take disciplinary action against officers who fail to appear in court without an excused absence.
- Inability to determine if court overtime is appropriate.

Cause: City Court does not always notify Court Liaison when an officer fails to appear in court.

Recommendation: We recommend management consider either:

- Requiring officers to provide a signed subpoena or attendance slip by court officials including the time period the officer was in court or, installing a time clock for officers to clock in and out and obtain signatures of court officials on subpoenas.
- Assigning an officer to City Court to monitor and verify officer appearance and time in court.

Implementing either of these recommendations should help:

- Ensure any court overtime is appropriate and that the officer is attending court.
- Allow the police department to not have to rely on the prosecutors or court personnel to report whether the officer attended court or not.

Management Plan of Action: To meet with the City Attorney, City Prosecutor, and the Court Liaison officer to find common ground regarding officer attendance at City Court. It should be noted that the Shreveport Police Department is in compliance with current laws regarding its obligation to deliver subpoenas issued by the court. When officers fail to appear, the court may take action on their own, and/or report the failure to the Shreveport Police Department for disciplinary action against the officer. It should also be noted that no officer is paid overtime for court attendance without verification of eligibility, and actual attendance in court.

Timetable: Agreement with City Court is expected by November 30, 2008.

7. Work Order System

Criteria: An automated work order management system would allow more efficient management and support of operations. The system would track the assignment of work based on priorities and provide justification of work performed. It would incorporate scheduled maintenance, replacement, installation and repairs of equipment (e.g., laptops, walkie talkies, in car camera system, etc.)

Condition: There is no automated work order system in place to aid management in assigning and prioritizing work and tracking service requests for the Fleet Services Unit. The division records repairs made to equipment in a log at the Police Department Patrol Desk.

Effect:

- Potential for inefficient operations.
- Potential for ineffective prioritization of work.
- Inability to efficiently determine number of replacements, repairs, installations, total maintenance costs (labor and parts).

Cause: The Police Department Fleet Services Unit did not realize the benefit of having a work order system in place.

Recommendation: We recommend that management implement an automated work order system that allows for prioritization and justification of work. To allow this work order system to be a valuable management tool, requests should be tracked from inception to resolution. This system would track the number of services requested and completed, including helping management and technicians more efficiently record and track the costs of repairs (labor and parts), time to repair, days out of service, etc. for those jobs that are not already recorded on work orders by Department of Operational Services – Fleet Services (Car Care). The system could be used to analyze costs and monitor trends in wear, neglect and abuse of equipment. The historical information could be used in determining when to keep or retire a piece of equipment.

Management Plan of Action: To implement a work order system in accordance with audit recommendations.

Timetable: A new work order system is expected to be in place by January 1, 2009, providing that budget considerations do not prohibit such action.

8. Performance Indicators

Criteria: In order to measure whether an entity is accomplishing its mission, goals, and objectives, performance measures that closely approximate the organization's work activities should be identified.

Condition: We noted in the 2007 Budget Book for the Police Department

IAR 060108-11

Administration Division that the only performance measures that were relative to the Technical Services Bureau were the: Number of Federal/State grants applied for/received and Amount of Federal/State grants received. During our review we noted that there were additional performance measures that could be used to measure the accomplishments of the Technical Services Bureau.

Effect:

- Inability to determine whether goals and objectives have been achieved.
- Inability to determine efficiency and effectiveness.

Cause: Management had not realized the benefit of using the additional performance measures.

Recommendation: We recommend that management consider including the following additional performance measures and developing a system that would allow for the reporting of the accomplishments of the measures:

- Number of positions descriptions developed.
- Number of bureau and unit manuals developed.
- Number of subpoenas distributed.
- Amount of revenue generated from police vehicle escorts.
- Number of equipment repairs made.

Management Plan of Action: To work with City Administration to offer additional performance measures for inclusion in the annual budget book and to develop a method of reporting accomplishments for those measures selected.

Timetable: 2009 Budget cycle.

9. Staffing Needs/Assessments

Criteria: Staffing should be appropriate to assure that the entity is accomplishing its mission, goals, and objectives. A highly professional, multifaceted, competent staff would help to ensure that the entity is successful in reaching its goals.

Condition: The Fleet Services Unit is currently staffed with one part-time office specialist (19 hours and 3 days a week) and two Sergeants and one Corporal. The Special Events Unit is currently staffed with one full-time office specialist and two Sergeants. The duties and responsibilities assigned to the Units appear to overwhelm the existing staff.

<Auditor's Note> As of April 2008, one Office Specialist has been added to the Special Events Unit and a civilian has been hired to replace a uniformed officer in the Fleet Services Unit.

Fleet Services Unit responsibilities include but are not limited to:

IAR 060108-11

- Coordinating the installation, maintenance, repair and replacement of equipment (e.g., walkie talkies, laptops, video camera system, emergency light and siren equipment, etc.) which includes shuttling police units to various vendors for the necessary repairs and installations.
- Maintaining the vehicle and equipment database for a fleet of approximately 600 units.
- Troubleshooting problems with equipment and making repairs.
- Issuing walkie talkies.
- Serving as administrator of the L3 system (digital mobile video system) and the Caddo 911 System, and the Fuelman gas cards.
- Coordinating with Risk Management and insurance agencies regarding vehicle accidents, incidents, shootings, and general liability issues.

For the Special Events Unit, since they only have two Sergeants responsible for staffing the events, when one is out on leave the other is solely responsible for all duties, including: staffing funeral escorts, movie productions and special events, and planning for events, attending event meetings and preparing invoices. During 2007, 2,984 events were staffed including funeral escorts, extra duty jobs and major events.

Effect:

- Possible low employee morale.
- Possible inefficient operations.
- Goals and objectives may not be met.

Cause: Budgetary constraints.

Recommendation: We recommend that management perform an assessment of Special Events Unit and Fleet Services Unit staffing needs based on their mission, goals, and objectives and determine whether it's feasible to hire additional staff to perform the duties of the Units or re-distribute the workload. This additional staff could be civilian personnel. Consideration should also be given to determining whether sensitive information and integrity would be compromised if civilians should be staffed in Fleet Services.

Management Plan of Action: At the time of this audit the police department was in the process of conducting a staffing needs/assessment of the aforementioned units. Once the assessment was complete, we civilianized Fleet Services and hired a Fleet Manager. We believe this change will make the unit more effective and efficient. We also hired an additional person to work in Special Events to help equalize the unit's workload. Together, the changes made in Special Events and Fleet Services will free up four uniformed officer positions and provide for more continuity/expertise within these units.

Timetable: Complete.

10. Vehicle/Equipment Database

IAR 060108-11

Criteria: To ensure the reliability and usefulness of the vehicle/equipment database the necessary information needs to be input to track the vehicles and equipment.

Condition: The Fleet Services Unit is responsible for maintaining the Vehicle/Equipment database for a fleet of approximately 600 units. During our review of the database we noticed there were several fixed asset numbers as well as a few serial numbers lacking for equipment.

Effect: Incomplete database.

Cause: Other pertinent duties prevented the database from being updated timely.

Recommendation: Management needs to ensure that the database is consistently updated and complete.

Management Plan of Action: We are in a transitional period with the civilianization of Fleet Services and the hiring of a new Fleet Manager. As mentioned earlier we will be researching to find the appropriate steps in operating and implementing the most effective Fleet Management System.

Timetable: A new fleet management system is expected to be in place by January 1, 2009, providing that budget considerations do not prohibit such action.

Prepared by:

Tamika Ford
Staff Auditor

Approved by:

Leanis L. Graham, CPA, CIA
City Internal Auditor

TF:lp

c: Mayor
CAO
City Council
Clerk of Council
City Attorney

IAR 060108-11

External Auditor
Chief of Police